

Offsetting carbon emissions with short positions: Do it for the money, not for the impact.

Carmine de Franco, PhD

Head of Research
January 2022

Hardly a day goes by without a government, a city, a corporate or a bank pledging toward a net-zero-2050 objective, thereby aligning to the Paris Agreement. The adoption of such commitments, when legally binding, is a significant achievement, although there is much debate on whether such pledges are realistic and sufficiently ambitious. Net-zero strategies are complex to devise and not easy to implement, especially for large and diverse structures, but, at least in theory, the path toward net-zero can be broken down into three parts:

- Avoid all emissions given the current state of the technology;
- Update internal processes to reduce emissions where they are unavoidable;
- Offset the remaining emissions.

Regarding the offset, there is a large and significant literature, including from international agencies, on best practices and guidelines. An important feature of carbon offsets is that the removal of GHG emissions must be scientifically proven and valid over the long term. To put this into perspective, it takes between 300 and 1000 years for CO₂ to naturally disappear from the atmosphere. It is worth noticing that the most influential guidelines and protocols for carbon accounting at corporate level – the UNFCCC, the Science Based Target Initiative or the GHG Protocol – explicitly forbid companies to subtract carbon offsets from their emissions when reporting their carbon footprint.

It is important to correctly frame the net-zero strategies, as this is a key element when it comes to building net-zero investment solutions. One way is to invest in companies that have set a net-zero corporate strategy. This approach is fairly simple, and progress toward the target is easy to monitor if data is correctly disclosed. It also has the advantage to signal to companies that commit toward net-zero targets that long-term investors are willing to hold their equity or bonds, thereby lowering their cost of capital. An alternative method using short positions aims to achieve net-zero and carbon neutrality by building long-short portfolios and counting the carbon footprint of the shorted companies as offsets. This is the approach that some quantitative asset managers have put forward to reach net-zero in their portfolios . It is reasonable to assume that shorting high carbon emission companies may have some benefits from a risk or financial point of view. If one's own scenario considers business and transition risks for such entities, ranging from stricter regulation to higher taxes, it will reveal a negative financial impact on their prospects. The short position would therefore make sense from a strict financial point of view, acting as a hedge against carbon and transition risk. However, shorting has no impact on the net-zero challenge that our societies must tackle to stay within the limits set in the Paris Agreement.

Sending a signal. One of the features put forward by the proponents of this approach is the signal that shorting a company sends to its management, especially if such shorting is done on the basis of its carbon emissions. However, this argument is not supported by the physical and technological constraints that must be considered within the economy. While there is undoubtedly substantial room for improvement, one must also recognize that there are economic activities, such as steel, cement, air travel, shipping, etc., which cannot be fully

¹ <https://www.aqr.com/Insights/Perspectives/Shorting-Your-Way-to-a-Greener-Tomorrow>

decarbonized given the state of the technology. Shorting these sectors and associated companies, even if one can reasonably have a negative view on their prospects, does not help solve the main challenge: how to build homes with decarbonized cement, or how to build bridges with green steel. As a matter of fact, advances and improvements in this field will only come from companies that are active in these fields.

Looking for change. Another argument posits that the pressure short positions exert on companies will force them to change. It is hard to prove that senior management responds to increased short interest on its company's stock by acting on its carbon footprint. On the contrary, high short interest could force it to deploy short-term strategies to "defend" the stock rather than focus on long-term net-zero policies. Such policies take time to implement and they must be sustained over decades, potentially by different senior management teams.

Ability to engage. A third argument is made for investors who would like to engage with high-stakes companies, usually with large carbon footprints, but are not able to do so because of their ex-ante carbon targets. Shorting selected high carbon emission companies, on the one hand, would give them a carbon budget that could be used, on the other hand, to invest in and then engage with other companies. The argument is not unreasonable, yet it is not clear why an investor who is willing to engage with a company needs to short other companies to do so. Investors wanting to engage and have a material impact may refrain from doing so given the potential cost that the short positions could represent. Why would a long-term engagement program need to be "financed" by short positions?

Cannot do net-zero! Yes, it is difficult to achieve a net-zero profile with long-only portfolios! But this only mirrors the difficulties that the world faces in reaching such a target. Shorting high carbon companies to reach net-zero is therefore an accounting trick that is unrelated to the fundamental changes that our economies and societies must undertake.

It does not add up. A final argument is related to the arithmetic of carbon foot-printing. If shorts are not considered, then carbon emissions won't add up at the market portfolio level. While it would be easy to accept this logic, the consequences are less obvious. First of all, the market portfolio is a poor representation of our economies: most emissions fall outside the scope of listed companies. Let us nevertheless assume that the market portfolio represents a closed economy, where companies trade products and services between them and emit GHG. If we want to build a system where carbon emissions add up to the level produced by the economy, then only Scope 1 emissions should be considered. We should not consider Scope 2 and Scope 3 emissions, as they are the Scope 1 emissions of other companies in the market portfolio (e.g., energy and utilities companies). However, using only Scope 1 emissions is a very poor and inappropriate way to address the net-zero problem, and indeed most investors already use Scope 1+2+3 emissions in their climate assessment (both from a risk and a sustainability point of view). Shorting high Scope 1 emissions companies introduces a systematic bias in the portfolio, which is of course manageable, portraying the view that only the companies that actually emit bear the responsibility for their carbon emissions. This is equivalent to saying that running a coal-fired plant to produce electricity is harmful for the climate, which it is indeed, while running a large datacenter, whose power is provided by the aforementioned plant, is not!

Improving investors' portfolio climate performance requires ambitious yet well calibrated reductions of Scope 1+2+3 carbon emissions without short-sell offsets, while engaging with companies to improve their governance on climate issues and promoting the widespread introduction of science-based targets. This is the only reasonable approach for long-only investors wishing to have a meaningful impact.

2 Emissions related to companies' primary activities only.

3 Emissions related to the energy consumed by companies to manufacture products and deliver services.

4 Upstream emissions related to companies' supply chains and downstream emissions related to the use of their products and services.

DISCLAIMERS

Ossiam, a subsidiary of Natixis Investment Managers, is a French asset manager authorized by the Autorité des Marchés Financiers (Agreement No. GP-10000016). Although information contained herein is from sources believed to be reliable, Ossiam makes no representation or warranty regarding the accuracy of any information of which it is not the source. The information presented in this document is based on market data at a given moment and may change from time to time. This material has been prepared solely for informational purposes only and it is not intended to be and should not be considered as an offer, or a solicitation of an offer, or an invitation or a personal recommendation to buy or sell or participating shares in any Ossiam Fund, or any security or financial instrument, or to participate in any investment strategy, directly or indirectly. It is intended for use only by those recipients to whom it is made directly available by Ossiam. Ossiam will not treat recipients of this material as its clients by virtue of their receiving this material. All performance information set forth herein is based on historical data and, in some cases, hypothetical data, and may reflect certain assumptions with respect to fees, expenses, taxes, capital charges, allocations and other factors that affect the computation of the returns. Past performance is not necessarily a guide to future performance. Any opinions expressed herein are statements of our judgment on this date and are subject to change without notice. Ossiam assume no fiduciary responsibility or liability for any consequences, financial or otherwise, arising from, an investment in any security or financial instrument described herein or in any other security, or from the implementation of any investment strategy. This information contained herein is not intended for distribution to, or use by, any person or entity in any country or jurisdiction where to do so would be contrary to law or regulation or which would subject Ossiam to any registration requirements in these jurisdictions. This material may not be distributed, published, or reproduced, in whole or in part.

Modelling or back-testing contained herein is no indication as to future performance. Backtested performance results do not represent the performance of actual trading using client assets but are achieved by means of the retroactive application of a model. Backtested performance suffers from several limitations, namely they are constructed based on hindsight, and material economic and market factors, as well as client will, may have affected investment decisions differently without such hindsight. Additionally, they do not reflect the impact of actual portfolio trading, which could have affected the price and availability of securities, as well as the transaction fees paid. Please note that if the performance of a strategy is calculated in a currency different from the currency of your area, any losses or gains generated by the strategy may be affected by exchange rate fluctuations (both upward and downward).

Copyright © 2016 Sustainalytics. All rights reserved.

No portion of this material may be reproduced in any form without the expressed, written permission of Sustainalytics.

Nothing contained in this presentation shall be construed as to make a representation or warranty, express or implied, regarding the advisability to invest in or include companies in investable universes and/or portfolios.

The performance represented is historical; past performance is not a reliable indicator of future results and results and the information provided in this brochure is not intended to be relied upon as, nor to be a substitute for specific professional advice and in particular financial advice.

The information is provided "as is" and, therefore Sustainalytics assumes no responsibility for errors or omissions. Sustainalytics accepts no liability for damage arising from the use of this brochure or information contained herein in any manner whatsoever.

Additional Notes

This material has been provided for information purposes only to investment service providers or other Professional Clients, Qualified or Institutional Investors and, when required by local regulation, only at their written request. This material must not be used with Retail Investors.

To obtain a summary of investor rights in the official language of your jurisdiction, please consult the legal documentation section of the website (im.natixis.com/intl/intl-fund-documents)

In the E.U.: Provided by Natixis Investment Managers International or one of its branch offices listed below. Natixis Investment Managers International is a portfolio management company authorized by the Autorité des Marchés Financiers (French Financial Markets Authority - AMF) under no. GP 90-009, and a public limited company (société anonyme) registered in the Paris Trade and Companies Register under no. 329 450 738. Registered office: 43 avenue Pierre Mendès France, 75013 Paris. Italy: Natixis Investment Managers International Succursale Italiana, Registered office: Via San Clemente 1, 20122 Milan, Italy. Netherlands: Natixis Investment Managers International, Netherlands (Registration number 000050438298). Registered office: Stadsplateau 7, 3521AZ Utrecht, the Netherlands. Sweden: Natixis Investment Managers International, Nordics Filial (Registration number 516412-8372- Swedish Companies Registration Office). Registered office: Kungsgatan 48 5tr, Stockholm 111 35, Sweden. Or,

Provided by Natixis Investment Managers S.A. or one of its branch offices listed below. Natixis Investment Managers S.A. is a Luxembourg management company that is authorized by the Commission de Surveillance du Secteur Financier and is incorporated under Luxembourg laws and registered under n. B 115843. Registered office of Natixis Investment Managers S.A.: 2, rue Jean Monnet, L-2180 Luxembourg, Grand Duchy of Luxembourg. Germany: Natixis Investment Managers S.A., Zweigniederlassung Deutschland (Registration number: HRB 88541). Registered office: Senckenberganlage 21, 60325 Frankfurt am Main. Belgium: Natixis Investment Managers S.A., Belgian Branch, Gare Maritime, Rue Picard 7, Bte 100, 1000 Bruxelles, Belgium. Spain: Natixis Investment Managers, Sucursal en España, Serrano n°90, 6th Floor, 28006 Madrid, Spain.

In Switzerland: Provided for information purposes only by Natixis Investment Managers, Switzerland Sàrl, Rue du Vieux Collège 10, 1204 Geneva, Switzerland or its representative office in Zurich, Schweizergasse 6, 8001 Zürich.

In the British Isles: Provided by Natixis Investment Managers UK Limited which is authorised and regulated by the UK Financial Conduct Authority (register no. 190258) - registered office: Natixis Investment Managers UK Limited, One Carter Lane, London, EC4V 5ER. When permitted, the distribution of this material is intended to be made to persons as described as follows: **in the United Kingdom:** this material is intended to be communicated to and/or directed at investment professionals and professional investors only; in Ireland: this material is intended to be communicated to and/or directed at professional investors only; **in Guernsey:** this material is intended to be communicated to and/or directed at only financial services providers which hold a license from the Guernsey Financial Services Commission; **in Jersey:** this material is intended to be communicated to and/or directed at professional investors only; **in the Isle of Man:** this material is intended to be communicated to and/or directed at only financial services providers which hold a license from the Isle of Man Financial Services Authority or insurers authorised under section 8 of the Insurance Act 2008.

In the DIFC: Provided in and from the DIFC financial district by Natixis Investment Managers Middle East (DIFC Branch) which is regulated by the DFSA. Related financial products or services are only available to persons who have sufficient financial experience and understanding to participate in financial markets within the DIFC, and qualify as Professional Clients or Market Counterparties as defined by the DFSA. No other Person should act upon this material. Registered office: Unit L10-02, Level 10, ICD Brookfield Place, DIFC, PO Box 506752, Dubai, United Arab Emirates

In Japan: Provided by Natixis Investment Managers Japan Co., Ltd. Registration No.: Director-General of the Kanto Local Financial Bureau (kinsho) No.425. Content of Business: The Company conducts investment management business, investment advisory and agency business and Type II Financial Instruments Business as a Financial Instruments Business Operator.

In Taiwan: Provided by Natixis Investment Managers Securities Investment Consulting (Taipei) Co., Ltd., a Securities Investment Consulting Enterprise regulated by the Financial Supervisory Commission of the R.O.C. Registered address: 34F., No. 68, Sec. 5, Zhongxiao East Road, Xinyi Dist., Taipei City 11065, Taiwan (R.O.C.), license number 2020 FSC SICE No. 025, Tel. +886 2 8789 2788.

In Singapore: Provided by Natixis Investment Managers Singapore Limited (company registration no. 199801044D) to distributors and qualified investors for information purpose only.

In Hong Kong: Provided by Natixis Investment Managers Hong Kong Limited to professional investors for information purpose only.

In Australia: Provided by Natixis Investment Managers Australia Pty Limited (ABN 60 088 786 289) (AFSL No. 246830) and is intended for the general information of financial advisers and wholesale clients only.

In New Zealand: This document is intended for the general information of New Zealand wholesale investors only and does not constitute financial advice. This is not a regulated offer for the purposes of the Financial Markets Conduct Act 2013 (FMCA) and is only available to New Zealand investors who have certified that they meet the requirements in the FMCA for wholesale investors. Natixis Investment Managers Australia Pty Limited is not a registered financial service provider in New Zealand.

In Colombia: Provided by Natixis Investment Managers International Oficina de Representación (Colombia) to professional clients for informational purposes only as permitted under Decree 2555 of 2010. Any products, services or investments referred to herein are rendered exclusively outside of Colombia. This material does not constitute a public offering in Colombia and is addressed to less than 100 specifically identified investors.

In Latin America: Provided by Natixis Investment Managers International.

In Uruguay: Provided by Natixis Investment Managers Uruguay S.A., a duly registered investment advisor, authorised and supervised by the Central Bank of Uruguay. Office: San Lucar 1491, Montevideo, Uruguay, CP 11500. The sale or offer of any units of a fund qualifies as a private placement pursuant to section 2 of Uruguayan law 18,627.

In Mexico: Provided by Natixis IM Mexico, S. de R.L. de C.V., which is not a regulated financial entity, securities intermediary, or an investment manager in terms of the Mexican Securities Market Law (Ley del Mercado de Valores) and is not registered with the Comisión Nacional Bancaria y de Valores (CNBV) or any other Mexican authority. Any products, services or investments referred to herein that require authorization or license are rendered exclusively outside of Mexico. While shares of certain ETFs may be listed in the Sistema Internacional de Cotizaciones (SIC), such listing does not represent a public offering of securities in Mexico, and therefore the accuracy of this information has not been confirmed by the CNBV. Natixis Investment Managers is an entity organized under the laws of France and is not authorized by or registered with the CNBV or any other Mexican authority. Any reference contained herein to "Investment Managers" is made to Natixis Investment Managers and/or any of its investment management subsidiaries, which are also not authorized by or registered with the CNBV or any other Mexican authority.

In Brazil: Provided to a specific identified investment professional for information purposes only by Natixis Investment Managers International. This communication cannot be distributed other than to the identified addressee. Further, this communication should not be construed as a public offer of any securities or any related financial instruments. Natixis Investment Managers International is a portfolio management company authorized by the Autorité des Marchés Financiers (French Financial Markets Authority - AMF) under no. GP 90-009, and a public limited company (société anonyme) registered in the Paris Trade and Companies Register under no. 329 450 738. Registered office: 43 avenue Pierre Mendès France, 75013 Paris.

The above referenced entities are business development units of Natixis Investment Managers, the holding company of a diverse line-up of specialised investment management and distribution entities worldwide. The investment management subsidiaries of Natixis Investment Managers conduct any regulated activities only in and from the jurisdictions in which they are licensed or authorized. Their services and the products they manage are not available to all investors in all jurisdictions. It is the responsibility of each investment service provider to ensure that the offering or sale of fund shares or third party investment services to its clients complies with the relevant national law.

The provision of this material and/or reference to specific securities, sectors, or markets within this material does not constitute investment advice, or a recommendation or an offer to buy or to sell any security, or an offer of any regulated financial activity. Investors should consider the investment objectives, risks and expenses of any investment carefully before investing. The analyses, opinions, and certain of the investment themes and processes referenced herein represent the views of the portfolio manager(s) as of the date indicated. These, as well as the portfolio holdings and characteristics shown, are subject to change. There can be no assurance that developments will transpire as may be forecasted in this material. The analyses and opinions expressed by external third parties are independent and does not necessarily reflect those of Natixis Investment Managers. Past performance information presented is not indicative of future performance.

Although Natixis Investment Managers believes the information provided in this material to be reliable, including that from third party sources, it does not guarantee the accuracy, adequacy, or completeness of such information. This material may not be distributed, published, or reproduced, in whole or in part.

All amounts shown are expressed in USD unless otherwise indicated.

Natixis Investment Managers may decide to terminate its marketing arrangements for this fund in accordance with the relevant legislation