

Governance Data: Where is the Alpha?

June 2022

Research Summary

Authors

Lan-Anh Tran

Quantitative Analyst, Ossiam

Carmine de Franco, Ph.D.

Head of Research, Ossiam

Alain Demarolle

Chairman of the Board,
Proxinvest

Johann Nicolle, Ph.D.

Quantitative Analyst, Ossiam

Investors commonly acknowledge that corporate governance, defined as a system of rules, practices and processes that sets how a firm is managed and controlled, has material impact on equity performance. Yet, despite its incontestable importance, corporate governance's quality and impact are somehow hard to assess. Several characteristics come into play, including heterogeneous corporate histories, cultures and structures, the different regulatory framework between countries (even in Europe), and company sizes.

In our research paper *Corporate governance and its impact on European equity performances*¹; published in June 2022, we aim to explore using a quantitative approach the relationship between corporate governance and equity performance by going beyond the classic approach that relies on the existence of allegedly good governance programmes.

To assess the difficult-to-interpret aggregated governance framework, we used granular data collected by Proxinvest, a French and European voting advisory agency, specialising in general meeting, corporate governance and shareholder engagement issues. Data used covered a period from 2015 to 2021 and included around 440 European companies, from 16 European developed market countries.

These data can be classified into three principal themes with material impact:



**Board
Structure**



**Directors'
Compensation**



**Shareholders'
Voting Rights**

For each governance indicator, we separated the universe into two subsets based on the value of the indicator. For each subset, we created an equally-weighted portfolio with annual rebalancing. We then aggregated the two portfolios, being long on the portfolio with the highest indicator value and short on the portfolio with the lowest indicator value. To verify whether our results were biased by sector or size effects, we performed the same test as described above while neutralising those effects. All portfolios were calculated in EUR, from January 2017 to December 2021.

Our study confirmed the important impact that corporate governance has on equity performance. To varying extents, most of the themes we have identified in the paper have significant influence while others may have only mixed impact. Among the most significant indicators, we can mention the level of a senior management bonus cap and the total overall compensation of the CEO, the number of board meetings held, the size of the board and the average mandate term.

We can conclude that it is profitable for investors to incorporate corporate governance considerations when building investment strategies. Our study considered a relatively short period of time (five years), yet was very rich from a financial data standpoint, as we included the drawdown in 2018, the bull market in 2019, COVID-19 and its economic effects, ending with the eventual recovery we witnessed after March 2020 and the strong sector rotation in European markets. As high-quality corporate governance is hard to produce, further research will be needed to assess and monitor how corporate governance will affect equity performances in the coming years.

¹L. Tran, C. De Franco, A. Demarolle, J. Nicolle. Corporate governance and its impact on European equity performances. June 2022.

Governance Data: Where is the Alpha?



Board Structure

Results (annualised alpha):

Category	Indicator	Annualized Alpha				
		"Direct" (Long High/Yes, Short Low/No)	Sector Neutral	Size Neutral	Δ Direct/Sector	Δ Direct/Size
Board Diversity	Gender Diversity	0.9%	0.1%	0.6%	0.7%	0.3%
	Nationality Diversity	0.9%	0.2%	0.6%	0.8%	0.4%
Board Neutrality	Independence	1.1%	1.6%	1.2%	-0.1%	-0.1%
	Remuneration	-2.6%	-2.7%	-3.4%	0.1%	0.8%
Board Experience & Organization	Stock Holdings	3.1%	3.1%	3.1%	0.0%	0.0%
	Average Tenure	3.2%	2.3%	2.6%	0.8%	0.6%
	Mandate Term	-3.2%	-2.8%	-2.9%	-0.4%	-0.3%
	Number of Meetings	-3.9%	-2.1%	-4.4%	-1.8%	0.5%
	Size	-3.2%	-2.5%	-3.2%	-0.7%	0.0%

- **Board Gender Diversity (+0.9%):** our study found a positive, but relatively weak relationship between high gender diversity and equity performance. It is, however, reasonable to expect that this relationship may weaken over time because of upcoming legislative and regulation outcomes on minimum gender diversity targets for European companies.
- **Board Nationality Diversity (+0.9%):** our results showed that greater nationality diversity in the board improves equity performance. This might highlight the importance of expertise and knowledge of foreign culture and markets brought in by non-national board members (for example, to better define international strategies, expand in foreign markets, or represent more efficiently the interests of foreign shareholders).
- **Board Independence (+1.1%):** our results show that a high level of board independence appears to contribute positively to equity performance. This aligns with the common expectation that high board independence is a key factor in protecting shareholder values.
- **Board Remuneration (-2.6%):** our results suggest that high board remuneration consistently penalises equity performance. In fact, if the fee paid by the company to the member as compensation for being on the board is significant in relation to the member's net worth, it can become a subconscious factor affecting their judgment.
- **Stock Holdings (+3.1%):** results shows that companies that require a minimum stock holding for board members perform better. Board members who own a company's stock could be more aligned with shareholders and show greater interest in the company.
- **Average Tenure (+3.2%):** our results show that companies with longer director tenure outperform those with shorter tenure. This suggests that long-tenured directors have more understanding and experience in company operations that help improve their oversight and advisory capabilities.
- **Mandate Term (-3.2%):** results show that companies with shorter mandate terms for board members tend to perform better compared to companies with members that have been in place for longer. A shorter mandate term puts more power in the hand of shareholders to exercise their owner's rights by re-electing existing or appointing new board members that better represent their interests. It may also be related to the ability to bring onto the board new members with diverse skills and experience, improving the overall ability of the board in decision making and oversight.
- **Number of Meetings (-3.9%):** companies with fewer board meetings per year appear to perform better. These observations suggest that an excessive number of meetings reduces board efficacy by impeding the cohesion and contribution of each member in discussion and decision-taking.
- **Board Size (-3.2%):** our results show that companies with a small board appear to significantly outperform those with large boards.

Governance Data: Where is the Alpha?



Directors' Compensation

Results (annualised alpha):

Category	Indicator	Annualized Alpha				
		"Direct" (Long High/Yes, Short Low/No)	Sector Neutral	Size Neutral	Δ Direct/Sector	Δ Direct/Size
Absolute Compensation	Annual Bonus	-2.0%	-2.8%	-2.8%	0.8%	0.8%
	Base Salary	-1.6%	-2.1%	-2.5%	0.5%	0.9%
	Long-Term Compensation	-2.1%	-2.9%	-2.4%	0.8%	0.3%
	Other Compensation	-2.3%	-3.0%	-1.3%	0.6%	-1.1%
	Total Compensation	-3.1%	-3.2%	-3.0%	0.0%	-0.1%
Relative Compensation	Senior Management Bonus Cap	-4.7%	-5.6%	-4.5%	0.9%	-0.2%
	Base Salary as % Total	2.8%	2.8%	3.0%	-0.1%	-0.3%
	Bonus Salary as % Total	-1.0%	-1.7%	-1.1%	0.7%	0.0%
	Long-Term as % of Total	-0.9%	-0.4%	-0.7%	-0.5%	-0.2%
	Other as % Total	0.6%	-0.6%	0.2%	1.3%	0.4%

- **CEO Total Compensation (-3.1%):** companies with low CEO total compensation significantly outperformed companies that award their CEO with large total compensation packages. This finding could suggest that excessive compensation signals an agency problem in a weak governance structure that could negatively affect the company's performance.
- **Senior Management Bonus Cap (-4.7%):** the result suggests that a lower bonus cap arrangement can be a highly effective tool and hence contributes significantly to equity performance. Setting and maintaining an appropriate bonus cap for senior managers can play an important role in controlling management's attempts to misappropriate company resources by paying excessive bonuses.
- **Compensation Package (Base Salary (-1.6%), Annual Bonus (-2.0%), Long-Term (-2.1%) and Other Compensation (-2.3%):** our results show that whether we consider the base salary, the bonus, long-term or other types of compensation, companies that have a more parsimonious compensation policy and award relatively less to their senior managers tend to perform better. Interestingly, the biggest gap is observed for the Other Compensation pillar, which tends to be company-specific and may eventually hide sub-standard practices in CEO compensation policies.
- **Compensation relative to Total (Base Salary (+2.8%), Annual Bonus (-1.0%), Long-Term (-0.9%) and Other Compensation (+0.6%):** a clear pattern emerges from our results: companies that pay a more significant part of CEO total package in the form of base salary show better performance. Meanwhile, when an annual bonus or other form of compensation represents a significant proportion of total compensation, equity performance tends to lag. This confirms the intuition that a high base salary proportion of the total package can serve as well-deserved compensation to effectively motivate the CEO, while avoiding managerial short-termism linked to inherently short-term incentives (such as a bonus), which possibly has harmful effects on the company's long-term growth.

Governance Data: Where is the Alpha?



Shareholders Voting Rights

Results (annualised alpha):

Indicator	Annualized Alpha				
	"Direct" (Long Yes, Short No)	Sector Neutral	Size Neutral	Δ Direct/Sector	Δ Direct/Size
Non-Voting Rights	-2.0%	Not Applicable	Not Applicable	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
Multiple Voting Rights	+3.8%				
Multiple Voting Rights subject to Holding Period or Register	-3.2%				

- Non-Voting Rights (-2.0%):** there is a nearly unanimous view against non-voting shares among regulators and scholars as it goes against the fundamental right of shareholders to protect their investments. Our results support this view, as we find that companies without non-voting shares perform better. However, we must acknowledge that across our data sample, companies with non-voting shares are relatively few. The results could therefore be affected by idiosyncratic factors of this small minority.
- Multiple Voting Rights (+3.8%):** the debate has been nuanced for multiple voting rights. Multiple-voting shares as a control-enhancing device mechanism can facilitate power abuse by controlling shareholders. But support for multiple-voting shares is growing recently as short-term shareholders often focus on short-term results and such short-termism can have negative impact on long-term company growth while rational and long-term shareholders will adopt strategies and policies that better serve the interests of the company in the long run. Our results support this argument: companies with multiple voting shares show better performance.
- Multiple Voting Rights subject to Holding Period or Register Mechanism (-3.2%):** when comparing different multiple voting provisions - loyalty voting regimes and other provisions such as different share classes - we observe that companies with other multiple voting provisions appear to generate better performance than companies with loyalty voting regimes. One possible theory to explain this phenomenon is that, even if the availability of this feature does not systematically materialise, its existence establishes an effective barrier to prevent potential hostile takeovers, hence letting management to focus on more long-term strategies.

Legal information

Ossiam, a subsidiary of Natixis Investment Managers, is a French asset manager authorized by the Autorité des Marchés Financiers (Agreement No. GP-10000016). This material has been prepared solely for informational purposes only and it is not intended to be and should not be considered as an offer, or a solicitation of an offer, or an invitation or a personal recommendation to buy or sell participating shares in any Ossiam Fund, or any security or financial instrument, or to participate in any investment strategy, directly or indirectly. It is intended for use only by those recipients to whom it is made directly available by Ossiam. Ossiam will not treat recipients of this material as its clients by virtue of their receiving this material. This material may not be distributed, published, or reproduced, in whole or in part.

This material has been provided for information purposes only to investment service providers or other Professional Clients, Qualified or Institutional Investors and, when required by local regulation, only at their written request. This material must not be used with Retail Investors.

To obtain a summary of investor rights in the official language of your jurisdiction, please consult the legal documentation section of the website (im.natixis.com/intl/intl-fund-documents)

In the E.U.: Provided by Natixis Investment Managers International or one of its branch offices listed below. Natixis Investment Managers International is a portfolio management company authorized by the Autorité des Marchés Financiers (French Financial Markets Authority - AMF) under no. GP 90-009, and a public limited company (société anonyme) registered in the Paris Trade and Companies Register under no. 329 450 738. Registered office: 43 avenue Pierre Mendès France, 75013 Paris. Italy: Natixis Investment Managers International Succursale Italiana, Registered office: Via San Clemente 1, 20122 Milan, Italy. Netherlands: Natixis Investment Managers International, Nederlands (Registration number 000050438298). Registered office: Stadsplateau 7, 3521AZ Utrecht, the Netherlands. Sweden: Natixis Investment Managers International, Nordics Filial (Registration number 516412-8372- Swedish Companies Registration Office). Registered office: Kungsgatan 48 5tr, Stockholm 111 35, Sweden. Or,

Provided by Natixis Investment Managers S.A. or one of its branch offices listed below. Natixis Investment Managers S.A. is a Luxembourg management company that is authorized by the Commission de Surveillance du Secteur Financier and is incorporated under Luxembourg laws and registered under n. B 115843. Registered office of Natixis Investment Managers S.A.: 2, rue Jean Monnet, L-2180 Luxembourg, Grand Duchy of Luxembourg. Germany: Natixis Investment Managers S.A., Zweigniederlassung Deutschland (Registration number: HRB 88541). Registered office: Senckenberganlage 21, 60325 Frankfurt am Main. Belgium: Natixis Investment Managers S.A., Belgian Branch, Gare Maritime, Rue Picard 7, Bte 100, 1000 Bruxelles, Belgium. Spain: Natixis Investment Managers, Sucursal en España, Serrano n°90, 6th Floor, 28006 Madrid, Spain.

In Switzerland: Provided for information purposes only by Natixis Investment Managers, Switzerland Sàrl, Rue du Vieux Collège 10, 1204 Geneva, Switzerland or its representative office in Zurich, Schweizergasse 6, 8001 Zürich.

In the British Isles: Provided by Natixis Investment Managers UK Limited which is authorised and regulated by the UK Financial Conduct Authority (register no. 190258) - registered office: Natixis Investment Managers UK Limited, One Carter Lane, London, EC4V 5ER. When permitted, the distribution of this material is intended to be made to persons as described as follows: in the United Kingdom: this material is intended to be communicated to and/or directed at investment professionals and professional investors only; in Ireland: this material is intended to be communicated to and/or directed at professional investors only; in Guernsey: this material is intended to be communicated to and/or directed at only financial services providers which hold a license from the Guernsey Financial Services Commission; in Jersey: this material is intended to be communicated to and/or directed at professional investors only; in the Isle of Man: this material is intended to be communicated to and/or directed at only financial services providers which hold a license from the Isle of Man Financial Services Authority or insurers authorised under section 8 of the Insurance Act 2008.

In the DIFC: Provided in and from the DIFC financial district by Natixis Investment Managers Middle East (DIFC Branch) which is regulated by the DFSA. Related financial products or services are only available to persons who have sufficient financial experience and understanding to participate in financial markets within the DIFC, and qualify as Professional Clients or Market Counterparties as defined by the DFSA. No other Person should act upon this material. Registered office: Unit L10-02, Level 10, ICD Brookfield Place, DIFC, PO Box 506752, Dubai, United Arab Emirates

In Japan: Provided by Natixis Investment Managers Japan Co., Ltd. Registration No.: Director-General of the Kanto Local Financial Bureau (kinsho) No.425. Content of Business: The Company conducts investment management business, investment advisory and agency business and Type II Financial Instruments Business as a Financial Instruments Business Operator.

In Taiwan: Provided by Natixis Investment Managers Securities Investment Consulting (Taipei) Co., Ltd., a Securities Investment Consulting Enterprise regulated by the Financial Supervisory Commission of the R.O.C. Registered address: 34F., No. 68, Sec. 5, Zhongxiao East Road, Xinyi Dist., Taipei City 11065, Taiwan (R.O.C.), license number 2020 FSC SICE No. 025, Tel. +886 2 8789 2788.

In Singapore: Provided by Natixis Investment Managers Singapore Limited (company registration no. 199801044D) to distributors and qualified investors for information purpose only.

In Hong Kong: Provided by Natixis Investment Managers Hong Kong Limited to professional investors for information purpose only.

In Australia: Provided by Natixis Investment Managers Australia Pty Limited (ABN 60 088 786 289) (AFSL No. 246830) and is intended for the general information of financial advisers and wholesale clients only.

In New Zealand: This document is intended for the general information of New Zealand wholesale investors only and does not constitute financial advice. This is not a regulated offer for the purposes of the Financial Markets Conduct Act 2013 (FMCA) and is only available to New Zealand investors who have certified that they meet the requirements in the FMCA for wholesale investors. Natixis Investment Managers Australia Pty Limited is not a registered financial service provider in New Zealand.

In Colombia: Provided by Natixis Investment Managers International Oficina de Representación (Colombia) to professional clients for informational purposes only as permitted under Decree 2555 of 2010. Any products, services or investments referred to herein are rendered exclusively outside of Colombia. This material does not constitute a public offering in Colombia and is addressed to less than 100 specifically identified investors.

In Latin America: Provided by Natixis Investment Managers International.

In Uruguay: Provided by Natixis Investment Managers Uruguay S.A., a duly registered investment advisor, authorised and supervised by the Central Bank of Uruguay. Office: San Lucar 1491, Montevideo, Uruguay, CP 11500. The sale or offer of any units of a fund qualifies as a private placement pursuant to section 2 of Uruguayan law 18,627.

In Mexico: Provided by Natixis IM Mexico, S. de R.L. de C.V., which is not a regulated financial entity, securities intermediary, or an investment manager in terms of the Mexican Securities Market Law (Ley del Mercado de Valores) and is not registered with the Comisión Nacional Bancaria y de Valores (CNBV) or any other Mexican authority. Any products, services or investments referred to herein that require authorization or license are rendered exclusively outside of Mexico. While shares of certain ETFs may be listed in the Sistema Internacional de Cotizaciones (SIC), such listing does not represent a public offering of securities in Mexico, and therefore the accuracy of this information has not been confirmed by the CNBV. Natixis Investment Managers is an entity organized under the laws of France and is not authorized by or registered with the CNBV or any other Mexican authority. Any reference contained herein to "Investment Managers" is made to Natixis Investment Managers and/or any of its investment management subsidiaries, which are also not authorized by or registered with the CNBV or any other Mexican authority.

In Brazil: Provided to a specific identified investment professional for information purposes only by Natixis Investment Managers International. This communication cannot be distributed other than to the identified addressee. Further, this communication should not be construed as a public offer of any securities or any related financial instruments. Natixis Investment Managers International is a portfolio management company authorized by the Autorité des Marchés Financiers (French Financial Markets Authority - AMF) under no. GP 90-009, and a public limited company (société anonyme) registered in the Paris Trade and Companies Register under no. 329 450 738. Registered office: 43 avenue Pierre Mendès France, 75013 Paris.

The above referenced entities are business development units of Natixis Investment Managers, the holding company of a diverse line-up of specialised investment management and distribution entities worldwide. The investment management subsidiaries of Natixis Investment Managers conduct any regulated activities only in and from the jurisdictions in which they are licensed or authorized. Their services and the products they manage are not available to all investors in all jurisdictions. It is the responsibility of each investment service provider to ensure that the offering or sale of fund shares or third party investment services to its clients complies with the relevant national law.

The provision of this material and/or reference to specific securities, sectors, or markets within this material does not constitute investment advice, or a recommendation or an offer to buy or to sell any security, or an offer of any regulated financial activity. Investors should consider the investment objectives, risks and expenses of any investment carefully before investing. The analyses, opinions, and certain of the investment themes and processes referenced herein represent the views of the portfolio manager(s) as of the date indicated. These, as well as the portfolio holdings and characteristics shown, are subject to change. There can be no assurance that developments will transpire as may be forecasted in this material. The analyses and opinions expressed by external third parties are independent and does not necessarily reflect those of Natixis Investment Managers. Past performance information presented is not indicative of future performance.

Although Natixis Investment Managers believes the information provided in this material to be reliable, including that from third party sources, it does not guarantee the accuracy, adequacy, or completeness of such information. This material may not be distributed, published, or reproduced, in whole or in part.

All amounts shown are expressed in USD unless otherwise indicated.

Natixis Investment Managers may decide to terminate its marketing arrangements for this fund in accordance with the relevant legislation

May 2022

